



The Recreation of the “Sapience” of Xue Baochai in the Translations of *Hong Lou Meng*

HE Tang^[a], CHEN Xi^{[b],*}

^[a] Master degree candidate, School of Foreign Languages, Hunan University, Changsha, China.

^[b] Professor, School of Foreign Languages, Hunan University, Changsha, China.

* Corresponding author.

Received 11 May 2022; accepted 18 July 2022

Published online 26 August 2022

Abstract

“时宝钗 (Shi Baochai, sapient Baochai)” is widely acknowledged as one of the most accurate descriptions of Xue Baochai. “Sapience” is her outstanding characteristic throughout the novel, mainly exhibited in her flexibility in dealing with various persons and her firm support for dominant feudal ethics. This article discusses the “sapience” of Xue Baochai recreated in the two translations of *Hong Lou Meng* based on the theoretical framework of systemic functional linguistics. From the perspectives of experiential, interpersonal, and textual metafunctions, the article finds out that by adding material process and imperative mood types, Hawkes recreates a more reckless and hasty Baochai deviated from the requirements of feudal female ethics. While by reducing the total number of process types and mental processes, increasing the modality value to express obligation and cutting interpersonal themes sharply, Yang presents a more aloof and reserved Baochai losing flexibility and sophistication. It is argued that the subjectivity of translators and their anticipations of readers play an important role in influencing their linguistic choices.

Key words: Systemic Functional Linguistics; *Hong Lou Meng*; Xue Baochai; Sapience; Translation

He, T., & Chen, X. (2022). The Recreation of the “Sapience” of Xue Baochai in the Translations of *Hong Lou Meng*. *Studies in Literature and Language*, 25(1), 90-101. Available from: <http://www.cscanada.net/index.php/sll/article/view/12712>
 DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.3968/12712>

1. INTRODUCTION

It has been recognized that in the process of translation, the reproduction of meaning, instead of wording, should be put at the central place (Nida & Taber, 2003). Systemic functional linguistics attempts to provide a practical grammar for discourse analysis and assess the sufficiency, effectiveness, and coherence of the conveying of meaning in a text. Systemic functional linguistics (SFL) is a model of linguistics that was proposed and developed by M. A. K. Halliday in the 1960s. Halliday puts forward the concept of the meta-functions of language mainly from three perspectives: ideational (further divided into experiential and logical), interpersonal, and textual (Halliday, 2014), and each aspect of meaning is respectively realized through the selections from the lexicogrammar, such as transitivity, mood, and theme. Each selection contributes to the meaning of what is said, and by dissecting the selections, we may learn more about how the language’s resources are employed to produce the meaning (Thompson, 2014).

Hong Lou Meng, one of the four great classical novels in Chinese literature, is written by Cao Xueqin, a declined noble and literator in Qing Dynasty. Its profound ideological connotations and splendid artistic styles have certainly made it the peak of Chinese classical culture. By narrating the luxurious life and the decline of an aristocratic family “Jia”, the book has significant thoughts on life and the most comprehensive depiction of ancient China. The encyclopedic masterpiece depicts many vivid and touching characters, and Xue Baochai is one of those widely discussed among scholars. Most contemporary scholars believe that “时(shi, time)” is the most accurate evaluation of Baochai. “时(shi)” literally means time, and is extended into the meaning of being timely. Cai Yijiang (2010) comments that Baochai can be described as “时(shi, sapience)” because she is aware of the current situation and able to consider the overall situation. Feng Qiyong (2011) believes that the word “时(shi, sapience)”

is a thorough description of Xue Baochai, which means recognizing the situation and grasping the opportunity. Feng Qiyong(2011) and other scholars such as Xue Haiyan(2003), Zeng Xianglong (2016) believe that “时” comes from Mencius, *Wang Chang Book Two*: “Po Yi was a sage of purity, Yi Yin a sage of deep responsibility, Liu-hsia Hui a sage of complaisance – but Confucius was a sage who understood for all things their proper time” (2015, p.180).

Mencius uses “时(shi, sapience)” to describe Confucius, which means the wisdom to act according to the optimal time. It indicates the ability to grasp the situation and deal with problems flexibly so as to get the ideal result. “时” is mainly reflected in Baochai from the following two aspects: to choose proper ways of dealing with different people under particular circumstance and to uphold feudal female virtue as a feudal noble lady.

Two English versions have been widely accepted as the most authoritative among hundreds of translations: *The Story of a Stone* translated by Oxford University professor David Hawkes and *A Dream of Red Mansions* by Chinese literary translators Yang Hsien-yi and Gladys Yang. David Hawkes' *The Story of a Stone* is the first complete English translation in the west and it is most accepted by Westerners. *The Times Literary Supplement* hailed his work as “one of the best translations into English of our time”^[1]. Yang Hsien-yi and Gladys Yang are the first translators who translated *Hong Lou Meng* into English completely in eastern countries. Guo Xiaoyong, Deputy Director General of Chinese CIPG, once commented that “Mr. Yang has an indelible contribution to promote Chinese culture dissemination and to strengthen the communication between Chinese and Western culture, which has a profound and lasting impact on the Chinese translation”^[2]. There are researches on the comparative analysis of the two translations, but mainly on the translation strategies, translator's style, culture studies, and so on. The recreation of the ideal Chinese feudal woman Xue Baochai is ignored, and this article aims to figure out whether the typical characteristic of Baochai is recreated in the English translations.

SFL offers a systematic perspective on the analysis of characterization. Montgomery (2004) acknowledged the comparative neglect of character in the systematic treatment of narrative and re-integrated linguistically the notion of character with that of events in the transitivity network. Few researchers are adopting SFL in the analysis of characterization in literature. Yu and Wu (2016a) analyze the recreation of different images of the same Chan master in different translated texts from translation shifts experientially, interpersonal, and textually. They also explore the roles of mood and modality in the recreation of Chan master (2016b). Tao and Chen (2019) analyze the image of the “chaste wife” in *Chang Ganxing* recreated in two English translations from the perspective of systemic

functional linguistics (SFL). The “chaste wife” image recreation also happened in *Jie Fuyin* from transitivity under the experiential meaning of ideational metafunction (Tao, 2019). Transformation of the image of government can also be seen by focusing on the linguistic choice in its Annual Work Reports (Yu&Wu, 2018). SFL, as a model of linguistics, has not been much used into translating literary works, and the current image studies cover only national images and a limited range of personal images, some of which are flat characters. This article is going to explore the recreation of “sapien Baochai”, mainly focusing on her tactful treatment of tricky situations and various individuals, as well as her firm support for feudal female virtue as a feudal noble lady. By analyzing the complex and sophisticated Chinese feudal lady Baochai, this study hopes to enrich the research content of image studies and offer new solutions to apply SFL to the analysis of complex characters.

This article is to answer the two questions:

How is the “sapience” of Baochai recreated in translations?

What factors might cause the deviations in the translations?

2. EXPERIENTIAL META-FUNCTION: WHAT DOES BAOCHAI DO?

Ideational meta-function is to talk about and organize human experience, and it can be further distinguished into two components, namely experiential and logical. The experiential meta-function is about the happenings and events of the world, like “who does what to whom under what circumstances?” (Hasan, 1988) and it is mainly represented through the transitivity system.

2.1 The Nuclear Part of Clauses to Make Experiential Choices

Transitivity is a linguistic system in experiential meta-function that enables a speaker to talk about events, occurrences, and “goings-on”. Transitivity provides a lexicogrammar resource through three main factors: participants (the entities involved in the activities), process (the activities), and circumstances (the place, time, reason, etc., of the activities). The process can be neatly divided into six process types: material (process of doing and happening), mental (process of sensing), relational (process of being and having), behavioral (process of physiological and psychological behaving), verbal (process of saying) and existential (process of existing) (Halliday, 2014). Participants involved in each process have specific terms, which are listed in the Table 1.

Each process type constitutes a certain model to achieve a specific domain of experience, for example, material processes are concerned with “doings” in the outer physical world around us, mental processes are

about what we experience inside ourselves like minding, sensing, and feeling, relational processes relate some attribute or identity to some being (Hasan, 1989). Among them, “the four major process types: material, mental, verbal and relational, cover the grammatical-semantic ‘space’ of ‘going on’, namely happenings, doings, sensing, saying, being, having, etc (Matthiessen, 1995). Therefore, special attention should be paid to these four main process types. “The type of processes a person is involved in is a way to establish the desired persona” (Hasan, 1988, p.65). Analyzing the types of processes a character is involved in can be linguistic evidence for getting the image of the person.

Table 1
Participants in each process (cited from Halliday, 2014, p.311)

Process type	Participants, directly involved	Participants, obliquely involved
Material	Actor, Goal	Recipient, Client; Scope; Initiator; Attribute
Behavioral	Behaver	Behavior
Mental	Senser, Phenomenon	Inducer
Verbal	Sayer, Target	Receiver; Verbiage
Relational	Attributing: Carrier, Attribute; Identifying, identifier	Attributor; Beneficiary Assigner
Existential	Existent	

2.2 Types of Processes Involved in the Portrait of Baochai

This section selects an excerpt when Baochai is dealing with a tricky situation when Jia Huan, the brother of Bao Yu and the son of Jia’s concubine cheats in a game and is humiliated to snivel by a maid. As can be seen from Table 2, there are altogether 14 processes in the source text: 4 material processes, 5 mental processes, 3 verbal processes, and 2 behavior processes in total.

The “sapience” of Baochai can be seen in her efforts to deal with various persons and avoid disagreements. Baochai has always “看” (mental verb, regard) Jia Huan just as Bao Yu. As soon as she “听”(mental verb, hear of) Jia Huan wants to play with them, she “让”(material verb, let) him join in, which indicates that she is kind and gentle. When Baochai “见”(behavior verb, see) Jia Huan get annoyed, she “瞅”(behavior verb, glance at) Yinger and “说”(verbal verb, say). She doesn’t “等”(material verb, wait for) Yinger to finish and “断喝”(verbal verb, exclaim immediately) when Yinger is grumbling by comparing Jia Huan with Bao Yu, indicating that Baochai is prudent and sophisticated not to annoy Jia Huan and protect the maid from offending the master. Baochai “劝”(material verb, soothe) Jia Huan to calm down and “骂”(verbal verb, blames on) Yinger, which shows that she is manipulative and sophisticated to control the tricky situation and deal with complex social relationships. When Bao Yu comes in, Baochai “知”(mental verb, know) his family rule that the elder controls and she “恐怕”(mental verb, afraid of)

Bao Yu would criticize Jia Huan, so she “掩护”(material verb, cover-up) for Jia Huan, which further implies that Baochai thinks twice before action and is prudent, sophisticated in well managing the relationship with others. Since material process is mostly related to our outer experience in the external world, and mental process is about the inner experience concerning the process of consciousness, the number of mental processes exceeding the number of material processes indicates that Baochai is delicate in mind and is prudent, likely to ponder twice before she takes actions.

However, there are some differences in the translations from the source text. Table 2 presents respectively the number of each process in Hawkes’ and Yang’s translations, from which we can see the differences more clearly.

In Hawkes’s translation, there are 9 material processes and only 1 mental process. Compared with the source text, the number of mental processes in Hawkes’s translation cuts sharply and the number of material verbs increases more than twice. The steep decline of mental processes and the sharp increase of material processes highlight the image of a much more active and straightforward Baochai without many complex mental activities. Hawkes replaces some mental processes with material processes, for example in the source text “看” (mental verb, regard) is translated into “Baochai had always behaved towards Jia Huan in exactly the same way”. In addition, more material processes are added without corresponding processes in the source text, such as “she did towards Bao Yu”, “(Baochai) made no distinctions between them”, “she at once make a place for him”. Replacing mental processes with material processes and the added material processes create a more active and outgoing image. In addition, some mental processes were replaced by relational processes, for example, the two “知” (mental verb, know) was translated into “(is) familiar” and “is unaware”. The added relational processes indicate that Baochai is sorting out the relationship of the persons involved in the event, and her deliberate classification of the relations under such a trying circumstance exhibits an image of a more innocent and simple-minded Baochai. Compared with the Baochai in the source text who is tactful in dealing with the complex relationship and prudent in taking actions, Baochai in Hawkes’ translation is more innocent and active, likely to act without much thinking, and is less tactful.

In Yang’s translation, the number of each process type is translated correspondingly except for mental processes. The cut of the mental process as well as the reduction of the total number of the process types in the translation makes the image of Baochai less vigorous and vibrant. Compared with Hawkes translating some of the mental processes into material processes and relational processes, Yang’s translation omits many mental processes such as “听” (hear of), “恐怕” (afraid of), thus it emphasizes less

on the flow of mental thoughts within Baochai. Compared with Hawkes' translation that shifts some of the mental processes into other process types and adds material processes, the omission of mental processes as well as the

reduction of the total number of process types in Yang's translation results in the impression that Baochai turns out to be more indifferent and reserved.

Table 2
Process types in source text and two translations

	ST	Hawkes	Yang
Material	4 让 (rang, let); 等 (deng, wait for); 劝(quan, persuade); 掩饰 (yanshi, cover-up)	9 behave; made; made; invite; command; order; check; hasten	4 treated; made; advised; covered up
Mental	5 看 (kan, regard); 听(ting, hear of); 知 (zhi, know); 知 (zhi, know); 恐怕 (kongpa, afraid of)	2 assume; fear	2 knew; realize;
Behavior	2 见 (jian, see) 瞅 (chou, glance)	2 see; dart a sharp look;	2 observe; shot her a reproving glance;
Relational	0	4 was shocked;(be) familiar with; was unaware; was ignorant	0
Verbal	3 说 (shuo, say) 骂 (ma, blame on); 喝 (he, exclaim)	2 told; rebuke;	3 said; told; scold
Existential	0	0	0
Total	14	18	11

3. INTERPERSONAL META-FUNCTION: HOW DOES BAOCHAI INTERACT WITH OTHERS?

The interpersonal meta-function represents the way the addresser and addressee interact, create and maintain relationships with others, exchange viewpoints, or influence others, just as Halliday puts that “language is always enacting our personal and social relationships with other people around us; and the clause of the grammar is not only a figure representing some process, but also a proposition, or a proposal” (Halliday, 2014, p.140). Proposition and proposal are the two major speech functions realized by the role of mood and modality.

Mood and modality are the two main grammatical elements. Mood refers to the mood types of indicative (declarative and interrogative) and imperative (jussive, suggestive, and oblativ). Mood consists of two parts: Subject, which is a nominal group, and Finite operator, which is part of a verbal group. “The Finite element is

one of a small number of verbal operators expressing tense (e.g. is, has) or modality (e.g. can, must)” (Halliday, 2014, p.140). The type of existence of subject and finite can help distinguish the different mood types. Interpersonal meta-function enables people to give or demand information, goods, and services in different mood types. Modality refers to “the speaker’s judgment, or request of the judgment of the listener, on the status of what being said (It could be. Couldn’t it be? You mustn’t do that. Must you do that?)” (Halliday, 2014, p.172). Modality is realized by using modal auxiliaries, adverbs, and modality. It is categorized into two terms, namely modalization and modulation when used for two specific functions. Modality is termed modalization when it deals with probability and usability in proposition, and it is termed modulation when it is to indicate obligation and inclination in proposals (Halliday, 2014). The value of modality can be graded as low, median or high according to the degree, which is illustrated in the following chart.

Table 3
Combination of modality type and value (cited from Yu & Wu, 2016b, p.4)

Modality type	Modality value			
	Low	Median	High	
Modalization	Probability	can/could/may/might possible, I guess	will/would probably, I think	must/should certainly, I know
	Usuality	can/could/may/might sometimes	will/would usually	must/ should always
Modulation	Obligation	can/could/may/might permissible	should/had better, it’s desirable	must/have to/ought to it’s necessary
	Inclination	willing to	will/would like to	must/have to

Mood and modality play an essential role in interpersonal meta-function to reach a certain speech function of the clause. From the perspective of semantics, mood and modality serve to define the fundamental types of speech role: give and demand (information or goods and service). These variables further demonstrate

the speech functions on the semantic level, namely statement, question, offer, and command (Halliday, 2014). Interpersonally, the way that the speakers (or writers) deal with the relationship with their audience (or readers) can, in a larger sense, exhibit one’s characteristics. This section selects an excerpt of what Baochai says to Daiyu

when she discovers that Daiyu reads unorthodox books. The following discussion will focus on how Baochai expresses attitudes and persuades others in different translations from the analysis of proposition(statement) and proposal(command), the use of mood and modality to realize the speech functions, and the type of image recreated thereby.

3.1 Statement: How Assertive Is Baochai to Convey Traditional Ethics?

It is found that when Baochai expresses her understanding of traditional feudal female virtue, she is purposeful and earnest in inculcating her opinions in sister Daiyu. This kind of certainty lies in the frequent use of sentences of polarity and modality of high value. However, it is

very hard for translations to reach the similar level of modality value because “the typical sentence structures in Chinese to reflect the tone are often different from English due to linguistic and cultural differences, and Chinese has many intonation words that English does not have such words correspondingly” (Si & Chen, 2018, p.66). Thus, great differences lie in the certainty of her expression, which is illustrated in Table 4 concerning the number of clauses with and without modalization, and the values of modalization. The value of modality is graded into low, median or high according to the strength of the statement, while the sentence of polarity (positive/negative opposition) without any qualification is the most assertive.

Table 4
Modality in indicative clauses as statements

	ST	Hawkes	Yang
Polarity	14(87.5%)	10(62.5%)	11(78.6%)
Modulated indicatives	16	16	14
Modalization (possibility)	Low value	-	1(can)
	Median value	-	4 (would do better not to; seem to; would do better to; wouldn't do)
	High value	2尚且 (shangqie, even); 何况 (hekuang, let alone)	1(certainly holds)

As the table illustrates, in the source text, there are two high modality values in the clause of modalization to express possibility in the source texts, others are stated in “yes or no” polarity sentences. The proportion of sentences of polarity reaches 87.5%, showing Baochai’s absolute belief in female feudal ethics. In Hawkes’ translation, negative or positive polarity has been sharply cut to 62.5%. There is 1 modalization in low value and 4 in median value to express possibility in Hawkes’s translation, which suggests the less determined Baochai in supporting feudal and traditional female ethics. In Yang’s translation, sentences of polarity account for 78.6% of modulated indicatives, which is higher than Hawkes’ but still lower than the source text. Besides, 1 modal expression being low valued and 2 being median valued lower the strength of the affirmative tone, but is still stronger than Hawkes’. Therefore, Yang’s translation does better in conveying Baochai’s assertiveness in the feudal doctrines, but still cannot reach the high level in the source text.

The rigid and obstinate feudalism is especially shown in feudal noble families. A noble lady at that time should follow the feudal female ethics or else her family and herself will be disgraced. Therefore, as to modalization concerning how probable the information is valid, Baochai is assertive and convinced of traditional female virtue. For example, when Baochai is talking about girls’ access to reading just for entertainment, she compares that with boys’ reading with no good purpose.

Example (1):

ST	男人们读书不明理, 尚且(even)不如不读书的好, 何况(let alone)你我
Hawkes	Even boys, if they gain no understanding from their reading, would do better not to read at all; and if that is true of boys, it certainly holds good for girls like you and me.
Yang	Even boys, if they study to no good purpose would do better not to study at all, and that’s even truer in our case.

In the source text, Baochai states her view by using modalization in high modality value like “尚且(shangqie, even)…何况(hekuang, let alone)” with disjunctive question “何况(hekuang, let alone)” to emphasize the modality value, which exhibits her strong belief in traditional feudal ethics. “Evolved from the rhetorical question construction, ‘何况(hekuang, let alone)’ itself has the strong rhetorical function to evoke response” (Zhou, 2017, p.82). In Hawkes’ translation, the combination of median modality value “would do better not to read” and high value “certainly holds good” cannot reach the strength of the source text. Yang’s translation combines the median modality value “would do better not to” with polarity sentence “that is even truer”, which is better than Hawkes in exhibiting the strength of the modality, but it is still less in an affirmative tone than the source text. Moreover, Yang and Hawkes translate sentences of polarity into clauses with modality. For example:

Example (2):

ST	所以竟不如(actually not as good as)耕种买卖, 倒没(actually not)有什么大害处
Hawkes	They would do better to leave books alone and take up business or agriculture. At least they wouldn't do so much damage.
Yang	So it's worse than taking up farming or trade, for in those professions they could do less damage.

Baochai uses the negative sentence pattern “竟不如(jingburu, actually not as good as)…倒没(daomei, actually not)…” to emphasize the harm of reading unorthodox books. While in Hawkes’s translation, two median values (“would do better to leave”, “wouldn’t do”) lessen the certainty of Baochai’s belief on the purpose of reading. Yang interprets this into a sentence with polarity in the main clause and a low valued modality “could do” in the subordinate clause. Therefore, when it comes to expressing personal belief in female feudal ethics by using the possibility of modalization, Baochai in Yang and Hawkes’s translation seems to be less determined, but Yang’s translation is better than Hawkes in expressing the belief in the feudal ethics.

3.2 Command: How Euphemistic Is Baochai to Command Sister Daiyu?

Modality is categorized according to the function of the clauses. There are mainly two functions in the excerpt, namely to express the probability of what the feudal female virtue is, which is discussed in the previous section, and to persuade Daiyu to comply with the obligation of what a female should do, which is to demonstrate in the following section.

There are two mood types namely indicative and imperative, either of which are chosen by different translators to realize the speech functions, which are shown in Table 5. In the source text, imperative clauses are omitted, and the clauses are all declarative to persuade Daiyu in a relatively mild and patient way. Baochai tries to be reasonable, and takes care not to appear commanding. In Yang’s translation, mood types are displayed correspondingly. He keeps the declarative mood type and turns it into two successive modulated indicative forms “we should”. However, the continuous use of “should” leaves the readers with the impression that Baochai is teaching or instructing Daiyu as an elder but not a gentle sister and friend. On the contrary, in Hawkes’ translation, he adds imperative mood types to replace declarative types, for example, “let us confine ourselves to good books…”, “let us avoid like the plague…”. Imperative clauses are regarded as the most direct and bald way (Brown & Levinson, 1987). The sequential suggestive moods make Baochai turn out to be much more candid. The added interrogative clause “what do we need to be able to read for?” is calling for a response, thus a more outgoing and passionate Baochai foregrounds.

Table 5
Realization of persuasion

		ST	Hawkes	Yang
indicative	declarative	24	21	20
	interrogative	-	1	-
imperative		-	2	-
total		24	24	20

As to modulation related to the scales of obligation, many modal particles like “倒好” (daohao, it’s desirable)、“才是” (caishi, should be)、“也罢了” (yebale, should be) in median modality value at the end of indicative clauses in the source text help to create a more mild and soft tenor, besides, the adoption of adversative conjunction “不过” (buguo, merely) in declarative mood type of low modality value for offering suggestions takes on a less didactic and authoritative tenor. Therefore, Baochai suggests in a gentle and earnest way that Daiyu should follow the obligations of a traditional woman. It is noticeable that when she tries to persuade Daiyu to read orthodox books, she is very prudent in using words that are not offensive to the sensitive girl Daiyu.

Example (3):

ST	所以咱们女孩儿家, 不认得字的倒好(it’s desirable)
Hawkes	So, you see, in the case of us girls it would probably be better for us if we never learned to read in the first place.
Yang	‘So it’s best for girls like us not to know how to read

In example (3), Baochai expresses the girls’ obligation of being illiterate in median value of modality. In Yang’s translation, he changes the modulation with medium modality value into high, which takes on a more commanding and condescending voice, which is unsuitable for talking to sensitive sister Daiyu. In Hawkes’ translation, the modality of median value is kept, but he mediates the median modality value by adding probability “probably”, which indicates her uncertainty about feudal female virtue. Hawkes translates other modality of median and low value into sentences of polarity and successive suggestive clauses. For example:

Example (4):

ST	你我该作些针黹纺绩的事才是(should be)…不过(nothing but)拣那正经的看也罢了(should be)……
Hawkes	…spinning and sewing are our proper business. What do we need to be able to read for? But since we can read, let us confine ourselves to good, improving books; let us avoid like the plague those pernicious works of fiction
Yang	As for us, we should just stick to needlework. we should choose proper books to read.

In example (4), Baochai suggests that they should only do spinning and sewing in two median value(才是; 也罢了)and one low median value (不过). Hawkes turns the indicatives with modality “才是” (caishi, should be) into sentences of polarity “spinning and sewing are our proper business”. The omission of median valued modality

reinforces the positive tone, and leaves no wiggle room on that point. The low valued modality “不过”(buguo, nothing but) and median valued “也罢了”(yebale, should be) are changed into imperative clause “let us...”, thus the image of a more rash and explicit Baochai appears, just as Yang Cheng(2019) concluded the way Baochai treats her siblings in Hawkes translation as being more passionate and enthusiastic. While in the original text Baochai still keeps a certain distance and is less emotional. In Yang’s translation, “才是”(caishi, should be)、 “不过”(buguo, nothing but)、 “也罢了”(yebale, should be) are translated into successive sentence patterns “we should ...we should...”, which presents a more commanding and forceful Baochai.

If we look at Table 6, it is noticeable that the number of the modality to command is much fewer than that to express possibility illustrated in Table 4, which shows that Baochai tends to persuade Daiyu by reason, but not by commanding her to comply with obligations by authority. What is more, 3 median modality values together with one low value in the source text indicate that Baochai is gentle and euphemistic when telling Daiyu what should do. One high modality value and two “should” sentence patterns in Yang’s translation make Baochai appear to be more commanding and condescending, while one high and one median value, as well as two successive imperative clauses in Hawkes’s translation, create a more careless and direct Baochai.

Table 6
Modality in indicative clauses as commands

	ST	Hawkes	Yang
Polarity	4	6	3
Modulated indicatives	8	8	6
Low value	1 不过 (buguo, nothing but)	-	-
Modulation (obligation)	3 倒好 (daohao, it's desirable); 才是 (caishi, should be); 也罢了 (yebale, should be)	1 (would probably be better)	2 (should; should)
High value	-	1 (need)	1 (it is best for)

4. LOGICAL META-FUNCTION: HOW DOES BAOCHAI ORGANIZE HER WORDS?

Logical meta-function, being the other component of ideational meta-function, serves to explore how the flow of events is construed by means of some kinds of logico-semantic relation to form text complexity. Therefore, the logical meta-function shows the speaker’s organization of her words.

To appreciate the complexity of the sentences needs to first sort out the relationship among clauses systemically. Taxis and logico-semantic relation are two basic systems

of clause complexing, which play a major part in determining how one clause is related to the others. Taxis describes the degree of interdependency between clauses in the clause complex. There are two different degrees of interdependency, namely parataxis and hypotaxis. Parataxis is the relation between two of equal status, one continuing and the other continuing, on the contrary, hypotaxis is the relation between a dependent element and its dominant (Halliday, 2014). Parataxis relations are represented by the numbers (1,2...) and hypotaxis by Greek letters ($\alpha, \beta...$). Besides, between the two related clauses exists a wide range of different logico-semantic relations, which can be first classified into two fundamental relationships: expansion (the secondary clause expands the primary clause) and projection (the secondary clause is projected through the primary clause). Projection can be either a locution (“) or an idea (‘). Expansion can be further divided into elaboration (=), extension (+) and enhancement (\times). In elaboration, one clause elaborates on the previous meaning by adding description or further specification. In extension, one clause extends the meaning of another by adding totally new elements. In enhancement, one clause enhances another meaning by qualifying it with circumstantial features of time, place, cause or condition. These two basic systems for measuring clause complexity are illustrated in Table 7.

Table 7
System of clause complex (cited from Halliday, 2014, p.438)

Category	Symbol	Category	Symbol
parataxis	1 2 3 ...	projection	locution ”
hypotaxis	$\alpha \beta \gamma...$		idea ,
			elaboration =
		expansion	extension +
			enhancement \times

To measure the clause complexity of one’s wording and further visualize the organization of one’s thoughts, attention should be paid to the two major systems of clause complexing. For a sentence containing the same number of clauses, hypotactic relation tends to increase the complexity of the text more than paratactic relation (Halliday, 2009). The distinction between parataxis and hypotaxis has evolved in languages as a powerful grammatical strategy for guiding the rhetorical development of the text. Thus, the choice of parataxis and hypotaxis indicates the speaker’s emotional changes and complex feelings, as well as the way to organize the altered state of consciousness.

This section still discusses the excerpt adopted in chapter 3 with the addition of Baochai’s personal narration of the book-banning in her family during childhood. The words of Baochai are divided into three parts with the consideration of the semantic relations, namely personal

narrative, command, statement of viewpoint on feudal ethics. The number of hypotaxis and parataxis across

different parts in the source text and each translation is shown in Table 8.

Table 8
Clause complex in source text and two translations

	ST		Hawkes		Yang	
	hypotaxis	parataxis	hypotaxis	parataxis	hypotaxis	parataxis
Personal narrative	6(50%)	8(53%)	2(12.5%)	6(60%)	4(21.1%)	4(57.1%)
Command	3	3	5	1	4	0
Statement	3(25%)	4	9(56.3%)	3	11(57.9%)	3
Total	12	15	16	10	19	7

As illustrated above, the different parts of her words present the clear-cut distribution of hypotaxis and parataxis. In the source text, the total number of hypotaxis and parataxis in personal narrative is much more than the two translations. The much less clause complex in the two translations suggests that there are many simple clauses. Besides, the largest proportion of hypotaxis in personal narrative within the source text indicates the most complex emotion of Baochai. When Baochai expresses command and statement on feudal codes, her emotion turns out to be much simpler, and the number of parataxis and hypotaxis in command and statement almost equals. The clause division in the source text shows that Baochai is strong in emotion to narrate her memory of book-banning. She tries to persuade Daiyu by empathy in view of the strong emotion when narrating a similar personal experience. She stays calm and steady when expressing commands and statements which may seem to be sensitive to Daiyu. Baochai is always strict with herself and set a high standard for her wording and behavior, meanwhile, she takes the initiative to persuade, and influence people around her (Yang, 2022). The even division of hypotaxis and parataxis exhibits her rigorous logic and meticulous wording.

In Hawkes' translation, the hypotaxis is only 12.5% in personal narrative while 56.3% in statement, which is exactly the opposite of the source text. The narration of personal experience is understated whereas the part for expressing her own understanding is highlighted, thus the image of a more indiscreet and straightforward Baochai is sketched. In Yang's translation, it is noticeable that the statement involves the most complex clauses, which indicates the strongest emotion of Baochai when states her view on following feudal ethics. Making commands by simple clauses and solely hypotaxis heightens the oppressiveness of Baochai.

5. TEXTUAL META-FUNCTION: HOW DOES BAOCHAI UNFOLD HER CONCERNS?

The textual meta-function, according to Halliday, is to "construe experience and enacting interpersonal meaning

into a linear and coherent whole – depend on being able to build up sequences of discourse, organizing the discursive flow, and creating cohesion and continuity as it moves along" (Halliday, 2014, p.30), from which readers and listeners can be well informed about the happenings and easily follow the speaker's thinking. Its major grammatical systems are theme and rheme. "Theme is the element that serves as the point of departure of the message" (Halliday, 2014, p.89) located at the initial place of a clause, rheme is the rest part of a clause. Speakers put the information they want to emphasize at the most prominent place as the theme, and guide the following information as the rheme. There are three types of themes: topical theme is the first item in the experiential meaning, interpersonal theme refers to the finite, vocatives, mood and comment adjuncts, textual meaning includes conjunctions, conjunctive adjuncts. A topical theme can be either marked or unmarked. An unmarked theme is a topical theme combined with Subject in a declarative clause, with the finite verbal operator in a yes/no question or WH-element in a WH-question, or the predicator in an imperative clause. A marked theme appears in an atypical or unusual position and should be highlighted because of the way it stands out (Yu & Wu, 2016).

Textual meta-function is about how the speaker organizes and conveys message in a coherent and sound way. Theme is the point of departure for the development of information that should be of prominent importance. Theme "unfolds from thematic prominence – the part that the speaker has chosen to highlight as the starting point for the addressee to thematic non- prominence" (Halliday, 2014, p.89). Therefore, the word put at the initial place of a sentence should be what the speaker wants to emphasize. Besides, the thematic progression throughout the text, which denotes the speaker's strategies to link the themes and rhemes, is an indicator of the speaker's interest preference and underlying concerns.

The excerpt adopted is the same as chapter three. The emphasis of analysis in this chapter is on how Baochai organizes her words to advise Daiyu to follow the female feudal rules. The analysis of theme patterns in each clause of the source text and two translations are listed in Table 9.

Table 9
Types of the themes in source text and two translations

	Theme		
	Textual	Interpersonal	Topical
ST	6(26.1%)	7(30.4%)	10(43.5%)
Hawkes	8(28.6%)	6(21.4%)	14(50%)
Yang	11(39.3%)	1(3.6%)	16(57.1%)

There are many interpersonal themes in the source text, indicating that Baochai is delicate in dealing with subtle mental activities. Baochai resorts to emotion to emphasize her belief and to stir up the empathy of the addressee. “就连” (jiulian, even), “究竟” (jiujing, on earth) express her idea that poetry writing and calligraphy as entertainment is not approved for men, not to mention girls. It emphasizes her firm belief in the feudal rules on women. “可惜” (kexi, unfortunately), “竟”(jing, unexpectedly), “倒” (dao, at least) highlight her unchangeable confidence in the benefit of wiping out unorthodox books. “偏 (pian, unluckily)”, “最怕” (zuipa, most afraid) stress her idea that women should not learn to read, not to mention those unorthodox books. Baochai, as a lady from a big noble family that upholds feudal ethics, has to obey the feudal rules that “lack of literacy in a woman is a virtue” and men must read orthodox books to become government officials. Even though Baochai loves reading and is very knowledgeable, she suppresses her desires and artistic talent in order to maintain the sacred and authoritative feudal ethics (Zhang, 2016). From the description in the source text, the image of a firm and strong supporter for the female feudal rules is sketched, and her utility of rich and delicate emotion in order to arouse the empathy of Daiyu is also depicted.

The interpersonal theme can better interact with the addressee and help to share an affinity between each other. As presented in Table 9, there is only one interpersonal theme in Yang’s translation. Hawkes’ translation is closer to the source text, though it still cannot reach the number of the source text. This sharp reduction of interpersonal themes in Yang’s translation makes Baochai a more distant and indifferent elder. Hawkes’ translation does better than Yang’s, but it still cannot fully convey the image of Baochai with sensitive and subtle emotion. There is an increase in textual and topical themes in both translations in comparison with the source text. It can be explained, to a large extent, by the difference in the language between English and Chinese. English is a hypotactic language, while Chinese paratactic (Nida, 1982). As a hypotactic language, English clauses are often arranged with some connectives. The logical relationships between sentences are expressed with the help of conjunctions. Chinese omits connective elements, but puts the cluster of keywords and sentences together to form an overall meaning. Besides, the subject in Chinese is usually ellipsed whereas the subject in English cannot be ellipsed because the subject

in English plays a crucial part in the realization of mood with the combination of finite in the clauses. Apart from the object reasons concerning the differences between Chinese and English, the great increase of textual themes in Yang’s translation indicates that Baochai pays much attention to the logic of her expressions, while much more logical conjunctions in her expressions make her sound a little pedantic.

6. CONTEXTUAL CONSIDERATION

From the above discussion and comparison between the two translations, it is noticeable that Hawkes and Yang have chosen different transitivity, mood and theme to translate a same source text. What causes the differences in the two translations and the deviations in creating sapient Baochai? This section is to discuss the causes of the different linguistic choices by the translators—David Hawkes and Yang Hsien-yi, Gladys Yang. Lefevere (2010) once pointed out that the image in translation is influenced by two important factors: the translator’s ideology and the dominant poetics in the target language culture. To find out the underlying reasons for the different choices by the translators, we need to go back to the background of the translators and their target readers, which play an important part in the interpretation of the context of a text.

David Hawkes is a native western translator who grew up in East London. His experience in China was during his study at Peking University from 1948 to 1951. He went back to Oxford University and has never come back to China ever since. From 1970 to 1986, he finished the translation of *Hong Lou Meng* with the assistance of his son-in-law John Minford. He was the first person to translate *Hong Lou Meng* into English completely for the first time in western countries. Scholars from home and abroad speak highly of the translation. However, as a native westerner who has only come to China for a few years, Hawkes hardly has the chance to experience the traditional Chinese culture and atmosphere. He lacks the knowledge of how strict rules were posed on females in traditional feudal China. Compared with the social situation in England, traditional China adds more restrictions on women. *Hong Lou Meng* was written by Cao Xueqin around 1792, which is at the peak of the high pressure on women. While the time when Hawkes lived, Europe has already gone through two major waves of feminist movements. The huge difference in social atmosphere and ideology renders some influence on the convey of meaning in the text. What is more, it is too complex for Westerners like Hawkes to fully understand the traditional family ethics in the ancient feudal extended family. This can partly explain the reason for the slight deviation in the image of Baochai who is more straightforward and candid, and have less determination in advocating the female feudal rules.

The anticipation of readers also influences the translator's choice in translation. In the preface of his translation, Hawkes states that he hopes to convey the charm of this Chinese novel to readers, which implies that his ideal readers are western readers. His translation considers the cultural background and acceptability of western readers, so he has to adjust his translation to fit the understanding of western readers. "Hawkes would turn to liberal translation that can express the information in a more acceptable way, making it easier for Western readers to understand" (Ji, 2020, p.33). It can be seen from the obvious feature in Hawkes' version that there is no footnote in the book. He explained in his own language some terms or Chinese-colored words or made an illumination at the end of the novel. The purpose of the translation is more of a popular reading novel for normal westerners to get a glimpse of the luxuriant Chinese culture, rather than for academic research.

Yang Hsien-yi is a well-known contemporary translator and an expert in foreign literary research in China. Gladys Yang, the wife of Yang Hsien-yi, is a British translator of Chinese literature. Yang Hsien-yi received a good education in traditional Chinese culture and the traditional Chinese family atmosphere has cultivated him into a scholar with a traditional Chinese temperament. Gladys Yang was born in Beijing because her father was a missionary to China. She became a lover of Chinese culture from early childhood, and then returned to England as a child.

Yang Hsien-yi and Gladys Yang began to translate *Hong Lou Meng* after Yang Hsien-yi was transferred to Beijing Foreign Languages Press as a translation expert in 1953. Before then, there was no English edition translated by Chinese, Yang Hsien-yi and Gladys Yang took the initiative to translate *Hong Lou Meng* with the aim of introducing Chinese culture abroad. "Gladys Yang, as his assistant until the 1980s, repressed the translator's habit of targeting cultural orientation and chose to conform to the translation principles followed by Yang Hsien-yi, namely, the internal translation norms of China Foreign Languages Publishing Administration" (Wang & Li, 2020, p.144). They adopted foreignization as a translation strategy in order to keep the specific Chinese traditional culture as much as possible.

The anticipation of Yang Hsien-yi and Gladys Yang's translation is to convey the traditional Chinese culture to the world. What they tried to do is to retain the most original Chinese characteristics for the people around the world to appreciate traditional Chinese culture. Yang Hsien-yi and Gladys Yang remained the original Chinese manners and customs in the source text and detailed footnotes are in the translation for a better understanding of the original text.

Moreover, the recreation of Baochai also has something to do with the prejudice within China at that time. It is widely accepted in China, especially in the early 20th

century, that Baochai is the destroyer of the marriage of Baoyu and Daiyu, and there was a trend for depreciating Baochai as a cruel and shrewd lady. There was also a misunderstanding that the name of the medicine Baochai takes—"冷香丸"(Leng Xiangwan, literally translated as cold fragrance pill) was the indicator of cold-heartedness, and her body heat was the symbol of the desire for power. The pervasive presence of depreciating Baochai in China may influence Yang Hsien-yi to a certain extent. It can partly be attributed to the result that Baochai is more of an indifferent and mature elder, who lacks the vigor of youth and detailed consideration for the emotion of others in Yang's translation.

7. CONCLUSION

From the perspective of systemic functional grammar, this article discusses the recreation of the "sapience" in Xue Baochai in the two English editions from David Hawkes, Yang Hsien-yi and Gladys Yang respectively, and discusses the contextual factors leading to the deviations in the two translations. By comparing the linguistic choices of Cao Xueqin and two translators from three meta-functions, namely experiential, interpersonal and textual, the article comes to the conclusion that in Hawkes's translation, Baochai is recreated to be more innocent and straightforward, less determined in supporting traditional female ethics, which deviates from the requirement of a standard feudal lady. Hawkes adds more material and relational processes to replace mental processes, uses imperative mood types rather than keep the original declarative mood types, increases the modality value in modalization to express possibility and lowers the value in modulation to demonstrate obligation. By contrast, in Yang's translation, the reduction of the total number of the process types, the cut of mental processes, and the replacement of the medium modality value into high modulation to express obligation, the sharp reduction of interpersonal themes make Baochai a more indifferent and distant elder without much vigor and consideration, losing her flexibility and sophistication in dealing with various situations and persons.

The decisions made by the translator during the translation process, in terms of omission, additions or lexical choices will result in the deviation of image in the text (Kuran, 2000). The deviations in the two translations can be attributed to factors concerning the subjectivity of the translators and their anticipations of the readers. Hawkes, as a native westerner, has a limited understanding of the traditional Chinese culture and customs. He can hardly get rid of the English culture and ideology when translating the traditional Chinese classics, and his target readers are ordinary Westerners whose understanding of the novel should be based on their own horizons. This is why the image of Baochai in his translation is tinged with the characteristics of a western lady. Yang Hsien-yi

is rooted in Chinese culture, and hopes to share Chinese culture with the world, so his translation aims to convey the original Chinese characteristics. The trend of belittling Baochai as cold-hearted in China may cast some influence on his depiction of Baochai. We can see that these factors can impact the linguistic choices of translators, and systemic functional grammar provides a clue for us to find out the different choices.

The construction and transmission of images is an important part of translation practice and research (Yan & Lan, 2021). The research of female images in literary translation not only presents the appreciation of artistic value, but also highlights various attitudes towards women in different social cultures between the two language-speaking countries. Thus, the recreation of female images can be attributed to social, cultural and lingual factors and so on. These factors will intervene in the translation process as well as the reception process. The image in the mind of the translator and the way readers understand it make the recreation of female images inevitable in translations, so the major task is to achieve the translation purpose as much as possible. Through the research on the recreation of sapient Xue Baochai, some considerations are concluded for translators to convey female images in translations: 1) To identify target readers and choose a strategy of domestication or foreignization accordingly. If the purpose is to introduce indigenous culture to foreign countries, foreignization should be adopted to keep most features of female images in the original works. Annotations are also needed to make the translations more academic and acceptable. If it is translated for common readers to have a glimpse of foreign cultures or just to enjoy the story, domestication should be taken to integrate the target language culture into translations, and the female images can be translated into her foreign counterpart for easy understanding and entertainment. 2) Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) offers inspiration in literary translations, especially for the conveyance of images. Transitivity, mood and modality, text complexity, theme and rhyme can be considered as a frame of reference for translating characters. SFL provides a new perspective for translating characters.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Thanks are due to my supervisor Xi Chen for her instructive guidance and Shilong Tao for the useful advice on this essay.

REFERENCES

Brown, P., & Levinson, S. C. (1987). *Politeness: Some universals in language usage* (Vol. 4.). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Eggs, S. (1994). *An introduction to systemic functional linguistics*. London: Pinter Publishers.

Feng Qiyong. (2011). Guafan review of *Hong Lou Meng*. Qingdao: Qingdao Press.

Halliday, M. A. K., & Christian. M. I. M. Matthiessen. (2014). *Halliday's introduction to functional grammar* (4th ed.). London: Routledge.

Hasan, R. (1988). The analysis of one poem: Theoretical issues in practice. In D. Birch & M. O. Toole (Eds.), *Functions of Style* (pp 45-73). London: Pinter.

Hasan, R. (1989). *Linguistics, language, and verbal Art*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Hawkes, D. (1993, 1997, 1980). *The story of the stone* (Vols.1-3). New York: Penguin Book.

Ji, X. (2020). An analysis of *The story of the stone* by David Hawkes from the perspective of prophecies. *International Journal of Arts and Commerce*, 9(3): 31-38.

Kuran, N. (2000). At the crossroads of translation studies and imagology. In A. Chesterman, N. G. Salvador & Y. Gambire (Eds.). *Translation in Context* (pp 143-152). Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

Lefevere, A. (2010). *Translation, Globalization and the Manipulation of Literary Fame*. Shanghai: Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press.

Matthiessen, C. (1995). *Lexicogrammatical Cartography*. Tokyo: International Language Sciences Publisher.

Mencius. Hinton, D (trans). (2015). *Mencius*. Berkeley: Counterpoint Press.

Montgomery, M. (2004). Language, character and action: A linguistic approach to the analysis of character in a Hemingway short story. In J. M. Sinclair., M. Hoey & G. Fox (Eds.), *Techniques of description* (pp. 143-158). New York: Routledge.

Nida, E. A. (1982). *Translating meaning*. California: English Language Institute.

Nida, E. A., & Taber, C.R. (2003). *The theory and practice of translation*. Boston: Brill.

Si, X., & Cheng, J. (2018). On the translation flavor of *A Dream of Red Mansions* from the perspective of systemic functional linguistics. *Foreign Language Studies*, (2): 65-70.

Tao, S., & Chen, X. (2019). Recreating the Image of a “Chaste Wife”: A multi-functional analysis of two translations of Li Po’s *Changgan Xing*. *International Journal of Comparative Literature and Translation Studies*, 7(4), 1-13.

Tao, S. (2019). Recreating the Image of a “Chaste Wife”: Transitivity in Two Translations of Chinese Ancient Poem Jie Fu Yin. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 9(11), 1433-1441.

Thompson, G. (2014). *Introducing functional grammar* (3rd ed.). London: Routledge.

Wang, B., & Li, W. (2020). Yang Hsien-yi and Gladys Yang’s comparative analysis of translator’s habitus. *Fudan Forum on Foreign Languages and Literature*. Spring: 141-146.

Xue Haiyan. (2003). The Confucian connotation and cultural reflection significance of Baochai’s “sapience”. *Studies on “A Dream of Red Mansions”*, (1), 282-293

Yan, X., & Lan, H. (2021). Approaches and methods of translation image research. *Shandong Foreign Language Teaching*, 42(3), 108-117.

- Yang, C. (2019). *David Hawkes' reconstructing the female images in The Story of the Stone from the perspective of cognitive construal*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. Changsha: Hunan University.
- Yang, M. (2022). Lady's character and Lofty scholar's feelings -- On the complexity of Xue Baochai's image. *Jiangsu Social Sciences*, (3), 198-205.
- Yang, H. & Yang, G. (1999). *A Dream of Red Mansions* (Vols.1-6). Beijing: Foreign Language Press.
- Yu, H., & Wu, C. (2016a). Same Chan master, different images: multi-functional analysis of the story of Huineng and its translations. *The Journal of Translation Studies*, 17(4), 143-180.
- Yu, H., & Wu, C. (2016b). Recreating the image of Chan master Huineng: the roles of MOOD and MODALITY. *Functional Linguistics*, 3(1), 1-21.
- Yu, H., & Wu, C. (2018). Images of the Chinese government projected in its work reports: Transformation through translation. *Lingua*, 214, 74-87.
- Zeng, X. L. (2016). An analysis of the meaning of "sapient" Baochai on the virtue and wisdom. *Studies on "A Dream of Red Mansions"*. (6), 95-109.
- Zhang, J. (2016). The content of "merciless" and the form of "Concealing Stupidity" -- Xue Baochai's creative techniques. *Studies on "A Dream of Red Mansions"*, (6), 80-94.
- Zhou, L. (2017). The connector Bieshuo in the latter clause and Hekuang, Kuangqie, Erqie. *Language Teaching and Linguistic Studies*, (2), 76-85.

NOTES

- Note 1. The Guardian. Remembering David Hawkes. 2009.9.23.
<https://www.theguardian.com/books/booksblog/2009/sep/23/1>
- Note 2. Culture China. Yang's passing away like a towering tree fell down. 2014.4.15
http://www.china.com.cn/culture/txt/2009-11/25/content_2014/4/15