Displacement or Complementary Effect? An Assessment of Traditional and New Media Use Patterns Among Elites in South-East Nigeria

Ifeoma Vivian Dunu[a],*; Gregory Obinna Ugbo[a]; Ebele Ezepue[a]

[a]Gregory Obinna Ugbo, Mass Communication Department, Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka, Nigeria.
*Corresponding author.

Abstract

In the face of the ongoing debates and discourses concerning the displacement and replacement effect of the new media on traditional media, this study analyzes the media consumption pattern among elites in South-East Nigeria under the framework of the Uses and Gratification approach, to determine if any similarities as observed in developed countries of the world will prevail in Nigeria. Survey research method was used with a sample of 478 elites drawn from government secretariats located in capitals of the five select states in South-east Nigeria. Findings show that respondents still largely utilize the traditional media for gratifying their various needs as opposed to the findings in other parts of the globe that suggest a seeming displacement and replacement effect of the traditional media by the new media. In the face of the displacement effect argument for developing countries such as Nigeria where the new media is still an evolving phenomenon, we therefore, conclude by projecting a rather complementary effect view based on the evidence that elites use and perceive the new media as an extension of the old media.

Key words: Displacement or complementary effect; Traditional and new media; Elites

INTRODUCTION

Increasing access to and use of new communication technologies among audiences in recent times have led to debates, discourses and assumptions on changing audience consumption patterns and the effects on traditional media. Prominent among these debates is the displacement/replacement effect argument. The general assumption suggests a deepening decline in the use of the traditional media by audience groups who are educated, the affluent and the youths, consequently bringing about the emergence of new media use pattern with a dominance of the use of the new media by these groups. Several studies have however, taken the middle course pointing to a situation where the new media has not successfully displaced the traditional media but rather has been seen as a complement and supplementary to the traditional media (Stempel, Hargrove, & Bernt, 2000; Kayany & Yelsma, 2000; Lee & Leung, 2004; Dutta-Bergman, 2004; Nguyen & Western, 2006).

Though the displacement argument among media scholars in the use of both traditional and new media by audiences could subsist in the developed societies due to high level of technological advancement, availability and accessibility of these new media, since most individuals own, access, and are particularly conversant with the use of new media technologies. But developing countries like Nigeria could be different, even though literature suggest a pervasive increase in the use of the new media among audience (Ogunlesi, 2013; Ezeah et al., 2013; Agboola, 2013; Agboola, 2014) the purpose and actual percentage of use by different audience segments in Nigeria have not yet been empirically determined. Except for instance, by the youths where research has shown that a good percentage of the youths have increasingly been making use of the social media and online platforms to engage mostly in social activities and entertainment (Adomi et al., 2003; Nwesige, 2004; Omotayo, 2006;

Alao & Folorunsho, 2008; Obijiofor, 2009; Agboola, 2014). However, the purposes for which the other groups such as the civil servants, politicians, academicians, business controllers, etc., use the new media in Nigeria are still relatively unknown, leaving a critical gap in terms of new media discourses and the complementary and displacement effect argument in Nigeria.

In the light of the current debate among communication scholars concerning an increasing paradigm shift in media consumption pattern of audience from traditional to new media technology, this study comparatively analyses the pattern of use of traditional mass media and the new media among elites in South-East Nigeria, to determine the dominant trend of usage of these media in relation to displacement/ replacement effect and the complementary effect argument. Specifically, we probed to:

a) Establish the level of media use among elites.
b) Determine the preferred media among elites in the South-East Nigeria.
c) Identify factors responsible for media choice and use among elites in the South-East Nigeria.
d) Determine if the use of new media fundamentally change elites' view of the traditional mass media.

1. REVIEW OF LITERATURE

Apparently, the proliferation of new communication technologies over the last few decades has increased audiences' activities by offering more choices and greater control over the communication process that is virtually unobtainable with the traditional media of communication. Buttressing this fact, Sparks (2003) as cited in O'Neill (2005) noted that:

> Patterns of media consumption are altered and renegotiated in Internet-based forms of delivery. In contrast to the relatively fixed patterns of existing media, online consumption is not bound by the same time patterns and daily routines they are consumed according to patterns of social behaviour that are embedded in daily routines. Consumption of the Internet is less structured and not as well established (p. 6).

Hence, audiences of the mass media today are enveloped in what McLuhan (1962) referred to as "new uncertainties" owing to changes in patterns of production, distribution, and consumption of media messages. It is then imperative to increase focus towards the audience to appraise the effect of these new alterations in their media consumption pattern. Lee and Delli Carpini (2010) further argued from the audience consumption perspectives thus:

> In speculating about the future and impact of journalism, as well as the nature of the Internet, it is important to examine both institutional (i.e. news production and distribution) and individual (i.e. news consumption habits or patterns) changes that come with digitization (p.3).

This alteration in communication patterns as previously pointed out, has given rise to the displacement and replacement effects debate of new media as observed in studies in some advanced countries of the world. For instance, the European Commission observes that while the percentage of its citizens using the Internet for news and information about the EU grew from 6% in 1999 to 14% in 2002, the proportion using television and newspapers for the same purpose was down from 69% to 65% and 46% to 44% respectively during the same period (Nguyen & Western, 2006, p.4). Also, Lee and Leung (2004) in their study show reduced newspaper reading, radio listening, and television watching by 35%, 40% and 53% respectively of Internet users in their sample (Nguyen & Western, 2006). This is supported by findings of the national survey by the Pew Research Center for the People & the Press, conducted December 1 to 5, 2010 among 1,500 adults. However, such studies are still few among the developing countries, thus necessitating this study.

This audience consumption study is a user-centred approach that aims to contribute to the ongoing discourse on the popular argument among media scholars concerning a possible paradigm shift in media consumption pattern among audiences from the perspective of developing country. We argue that narratives within these debates which posit that the traditional mass media technology is fast being supplanted by the new media resulting in what media scholars consider as paradigm shift(displacement effect) from traditional to new media; the latter suffocating the former, are mostly western-centric without taking into account regional variations in other subcultures. In Nigeria for instance, even with high Internet penetration and convergence where almost all Nigerian newspapers are online and television and radio stations are streamed, most audiences, except maybe the youths, are not yet conversant with the online application driven technology of the new media. Financially, majority of the Nigerian audience do not have individual access to the Internet as is in the developed countries and they find it time consuming and a challenge to always surf the net by using Internet cafe services. In addition to these challenges most people still regard the new media as "new invention" to be embraced gradually. They still fall back on traditional media as main source of information and even entertainment and look at the new media as an additional source. Some have also argued against the credibility of information sources of the new media likening it to 'sensational tabloids' that are not to be trusted due to its loose gate keeping process.

For most, the new media is seen as providing breaking news and additional information that may not be covered by the traditional media. While the traditional media still dominate as the major and credible source of information. All these relatively affect audience consumption pattern in Nigeria as in other developing societies. We also argue as pointed out by scholars elsewhere that each medium serves its audiences in different manner within different contexts and that the audiences since they are active

users usually select particular medium that best gratifies particular need. Therefore media use pattern by audiences could be affected by these variables resulting in a situation quite different from what we see in developed societies. In this instance what Nguyen and Western (2006) suggest becoming relevant as they posit that in a broader context, we could then argue that different media as different content (information and/or entertainment) resources will coexist for a number of reasons.

It is in consideration of all these variables that we purposefully choose to study the elites in Nigeria since they are among the audience in Nigeria for instance who have high internet access, availability and use and have also been exposed to trainings on how to use the new technology. It takes added skills to manipulate the new communication technologies unlike the traditional media. This is due to the fact that a significant factor in online activity remains the issue of interactivity, hence socio-economically advantaged segments of the population such as elites, it is assumed will be heavy media users, of both traditional mass media (newspapers, magazines, radio, TVs, etc.) and the new media. The researchers made this assumption based also on the premise that the elites have the purchasing power to access both the traditional and new media platforms, and therefore, it is assumed that their exposure to the media is high.

The elites as used in this study represent individuals between 40 to 64 years of age, falling under Palfrey and Grasser's idea (2008) of digital immigrants. They are experts in the use of both traditional and new media since they grew up in an era when while print news was still important, television and radio news dominated, and Internet news was emerging. Thus, they possess the characteristics that would help achieve the objectives of the study. They possess considerable level of education that puts them in a vantage position to be able to access and understand the language and characters of both traditional and new media channels.

Consequently, this work is limited to a comparative analysis of traditional and new media use pattern among elites in the South-East Nigeria. It focuses on the group of audience that is established with access, power, and knowledge to have both the traditional and new media forms at their disposal in their day-to-day activities. The South-East as a geo-political zone can adequately represent the other four zones in the country since the civil servants in the five secretariats of the five constituent states of the South-East Nigeria share similar structure and characterization with those of other remaining five geographical regions, which are replicated from the Federal Civil Service Commission of Nigeria. The approximated number of people under the age of 40-64 in the five states of the region surveyed in this study is put at 2,761,503 (2006 Population and Housing Census of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, NPC).

2. THE IMPERATIVE OF MEDIA USE STUDY

Another reason for focusing on the audience perhaps could be understood from the media content convergence in a single platform, reflecting a term known among researchers as "shovelware" where the same information is "copy-and-pasted" across different media (Lin, Salwen, Garrison, & Driscoll, 2005; Barnhurst, 2007; Quandt, 2008). The above analysis finds echo in Weldon's finding (2008) that all the "most-read" news articles on the website of New York Times on December 14, 2006 were "shoveled to the website from the print version. It is found that print newspapers provide as much as ninety percent of the news content on the Internet. As the Internet becomes the extension, rather than revolution, of traditional news media and with traditional news media's dominance on the Internet, online diversity of news content is "astonishingly shallow" (Hindman, 2007; Tewksbury, 2003; Ahlers, 2006; Robinson, 2007; Lee & Delli Carpini, 2010). Corroborating the above view, Hindman (2007) as quoted in Lee and Delli Carpini (2010) illuminates the same trend in the American context thus:

> Of the nation's two hundred most widely circulated newspapers, all now publish their content on the World Wide Web, either on their own websites or on a site shared with another news organization. With only a handful of exceptions, newspaper websites overwhelmingly present the same articles, prepared by the same staff, as the paper's print edition (p.4).

This has also become a common practice in Nigeria, where almost all the print media in Nigeria also have an online version. With this new development we then need to determine the effect this might have on the media consumption pattern of Nigerian elites who have high access, and affordability of both traditional and new media forms. What media consumption trend do they gravitate to in reading most of their news and why.

3. REVIEW OF EMPIRICAL STUDIES

Most studies in Nigeria relating to new media, concentrate on and reveal a high adoption and use of the Internet by younger people. In a study of level of penetration of Internet usage among undergraduate students in Nigeria using Obafemi Awolowo University as a case study, Awoleye, Siyanbola and Oladipo (2008) discovered that a majority of students (92%) have embraced the Internet and are using it consistently. The authors also investigated point of Internet access, time spent online, gender attitude to the Internet, science and non-science student usage and Internet services usage preferences amongst others.

Results show that students use the Internet mostly for email, information search and online chatting; all of these were found to have significant impact on their academics and social life. Further analyses revealed that gender attitude is also an important issue. Male students appear to

use the Internet more than their female counterparts; just as science based students use it more than the non-science based students.

In Nigeria also, Omotayo (2006) studied the use of Internet among under graduate students within the age range of 17 to 30 years at Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife. Ten faculties were covered using stratified sampling method to select the respondents. Findings suggest an over-whelming accessibility of students to Internet facilities. The major access point was shown to be the cybercafés, and students' use of the Internet has not affected their use of the library.

In a related study, University students in South-West Nigeria who are of age 16-24 were studied in Oyero's work (2013) which sought to assess how young people use social networks (Facebook, Twitter, Hi5, Myspace, etc.) as news sources and the preference of young people between the social networks and traditional mass media as news source as well as the extent to which young people believe social network news/information.

Results show that majority of the students use social networks as their primary sources of news information due to convenience and portability of devices for assessing it such as smart phones. Students who use social networks for news information also use them for interaction and entertainment. While they prefer social networks as sources of news, they use traditional media for crosschecking information gotten on the social media. This finding supports the argument in favour of the complementary/supplementary role of the new media in the use of traditional media, and places more credibility on traditional media against the new media.

Students of 18 to 24 years of age in Ilorin, Nigeria were studied in Agboola's work (2013), which sought to assess the effects of Internet use on political information efficacy. Results show that the majority of students were skillful email users while another majority use Internet frequently. The male respondents in the study are more likely to be efficient in their political information seeking, more politically mobilized and likely to participate more politically online. The study as in this current research was anchored on the uses and gratifications theory, which seeks gratifications and motivations for audience use of the media.

Hargrove and Bernt's study conducted in Stempel (as cited in Nguyen & Western, 2006) where they compared survey data between 1995 and 1999 to discover that although there was a considerable decline in regular traditional media usage, Internet had no adverse effect on the use of traditional news products, but also show that Internet users were more likely than non-users in all age, income, education, and sex groups to read newspapers and listen to radio news. They concluded that Internet and traditional media uses are supplementary or complementary. The more people use the Internet, the more they use traditional media.

Chan and Fang's study (2007) of the use of traditional media as well as the Internet among young people in Hong Kong is significant as well as relevant to this current study, though it does not focus on the elites but rather on the younger media users. The relationship of their study to the current work is in the quest for understanding of the latest trend in traditional and new media for use in the light of the displacement effect debate among scholars. Chan and Fang also used the Uses and Gratification Theory as well as the survey method and age segmentation in their analyses just as in the current study. Their findings were in consonance with several studies elsewhere. The Internet was the young people's preferred media of choice for information driven activities such as blogs, chats, discussions, etc, magazines retained importance for entertainment and shopping activities while television retained importance for news and current affairs.

Gaddy's review (2010) of the Knights Fellows in Community Journalism Survey of how different age groups use and want their news in Alabama revealed that despite many national findings to the contrary, many young Alabama readers still use the print newspaper. Also, young (19-29) and middle-aged (30-49) readers are seeking news through social networking and mobile devices as alternative.

In Malaysia, media scholars argue that new media have less impact on conventional media, in that, newspapers are not as hard hit as their counterpart in the USA. Salman, Ibrahim, HJ.Abdullah, Mustaffa and Mahbob (2011) identified the rationale behind perceived popularity and acceptance of new media in Malaysia as having connection with the people's need to have freer information flow as the mainstream media is seen to be controlled by the government.

However, Yap (2009) in his study (as cited in Salman et al., 2011) argue that "Internet might have become a force to be reckoned with in the political arena, but the reality is that most Malaysians still get their news from conventional media like newspapers and TV" (p.6).

In other words, although a number of Malaysian newspapers have online presence, the authors are of the view that newspapers and the new media in Malaysia are complementing each other. . .

Contrary to empirical results from previous studies, findings of the national survey by the Pew Research Center for the People & the Press, conducted December 1 to 5, 2010 among 1,500 adults reached on cell phones and landlines show that more people continue to cite the Internet than newspapers as their main source of news, reflecting both the growth of the Internet and attendant gradual decline in newspaper readership. On the generational perspective, for the first time, it was reported that the Internet has surpassed television as the main source of national and international news for people younger than 30.

Also, in the report, among those 30 to 49, the Internet is on track to equal, or perhaps surpass television as the main source of national and international news within the next few years. Surprisingly, newspapers compete with the Internet as main sources of national and international news for people ages 50 to 64, though their percentages are still far below television.

A previous report of the Pew Research Center's Internet & American Life Project survey of over 2,250 US adults show that Internet users over age 50 flock around the social media mostly to keep in touch with friends, hunt for people from their past, and seek support for chronic illnesses. According to the author, Mary Madden, a Pew senior research specialist, though young adults continue to be the heaviest users of social media; their growth pales in comparison with recent gains made by older users. The report said that social networking use among Internet users ages 50 and older nearly doubled from 22% in April 2006 to 42% in May 2010. This trend sharply contradicts postulations in the complementary debate among researchers, thereby increasing the curiosity embedded in this current study since elites surveyed include mostly users who are older. Literature as we have seen, is indicative of polarization among audience members from different cultures in the ongoing displacement and complementary debate effect of the new media over the old media. What we see might not necessarily point to a paradigm shift but an evolution in media consumption patterns among audiences in different sub cultures which will continue to unfold as changing patterns of media penetration, access, use, knowledge and affordability among other factors continue to intersect with new developments and convergence within the media environment.

4. THE USES AND GRATIFICATION THEORY IN PERSPECTIVE

The key concept of the Uses and Gratification (U&G) perspective, is that the choices people make when consuming media are motivated by their desire to gratify a range of needs and the concept of motivation deals with the type of perceived incentives or rewards which motivates an individual to take action and engage themselves in a particular media use (Roy, 2008).

Katz et al. (1974) proposed basic tenets that form the tripod upon which the foundation of Uses and Gratification theory stands, thus:

a) Media users are goal directed in their behaviour
b) They are active.
c) They are aware of their needs and select the media to gratify their needs (as cited in Roy, 2008, p.78).

Media scholars have applied this theory to different media of mass communication such as newspapers, radio, television, cable television, watching television soaps and Internet.

Although the U&G theory has been largely criticized for being too individualistic by scholars, (see Katz, 1987; Ruggiero, 2000; Roy, 2008; Wimmer & Dominick, 1994; Elliot, 1974; Severin and Tankard, 1997), but despite the perceived theoretical and methodological imperfections of the Uses and Gratification Theory, today's complex topographies of the new media, engendered by concepts as interactivity (Williams, Rice, & Rogers, 1988; Lister, Dovey, Giddings, Grant, & Kelly, 2003; Scolari, 2009) demassification (Williams et al., 1988; Chamberlain, 1994) asynchroneity (Williams, *et al.*, 1988; Chamberlain, 1994) hypertextuality (Landow, 1991; Miall, 1999; Bolter, 2003; Scolari, 2009) collaborative communication, digitalization, virtuality, dispersion, hypermedia (Lister et al., 2003; Scolari, 2009) new abundances (Deifell, 2009) automation, modularity, variability and transcoding (Manovich, 2001) have granted the perspective a renewed relevance in the 21st Century. This reality finds echo in Ruggiero's observation (2000) that:

> As new technologies present people with more and more media choices, motivation and satisfaction become even more crucial components of audience analysis. Not surprisingly, researchers have been busy applying Uses and Gratification theory to a wide range of newly popularized video media technologies (p.14).

Chamberlain (1994) argued that we have entered an era of demassification in which the individual media user is able, through new technologies, to pick from a large selection of media, previously shared only with other individuals as mass media. Unlike traditional mass media, new media like the Internet provide selectivity characteristics that allow individuals to tailor messages to their needs (Ruggiero, 2000, p.16).

In other words, each of the new media concepts – interactivity, abundance, demassification, asynchroneity, etc., offers a vortex of communication behaviours to examine, using the uses and gratification theory. Media scholars have also suggested that traditional models of Uses and Gratification may still provide a useful framework from which to begin to study the internet and new media communication (Kuehn, 1994; December, 1996; Morris & Ogan, 1996; Ruggiero, 2000).

Thus, Uses and Gratification research may well play a major role in answering initial web use questions of prurience, curiosity, profit seeking, and sociability. Uses and Gratification also, hold the prospect for understanding the Internet's mutability, or its broad range of communication that goes on in the cyberspace (Newhagen & Rafaeli, 1996; Ruggiero, 2000). In the light of the above argument and the nature of this current study, the perspectives of the Uses and Gratification theory becomes relevant as the theoretical frame work for quantitative analysis of the elites' media consumption patterns of and interaction with both the traditional and the new media forms and contents in Nigeria.

5. METHODOLOGY

This study was designed as a survey. The suitability of the survey method was informed by the need to collect data from the elites within the five states in the South-East geopolitical zone of Nigeria, viz.: Imo, Anambra, Enugu, Abia and Ebonyi States. Data collected from the elites segment of the audience in the South-East Nigeria were in regard to their media use patterns; access and exposure level to both old and new media; motivations for choice of media form; popularity of new and traditional media platforms; and perception of traditional media in the new media environment.

In the context of this study, we adopt the construct of elites to be secondarily categorised as people between the ages of 40-60 due to cultural/socio-economic considerations and realities instead of from 25-64 to also make for adequate representation of the characteristics of the population under study. From the National Population Commission's (NPC) report of the *2006* Population and Housing Census of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, there is a total of 2,761,503 adults within the stated age bracket and this constitutes the population of this study.

The sample for this study was drawn from elites (aged 40-64) working at state government secretariats located in capitals of the five constituent states of the region. Senior civil servants of grade levels 8 to 16 were sampled in the survey.

Notably, state ministries all over the federation are basically created in line with the existing ministries at the federal government level. In addition, state ministries can be expanded based on peculiarities of resource features or profile of the state and vision of a government. Thus, during the study there were seventeen (17) ministries in Imo State; twenty-four (24) in Enugu State; twenty-two (22) in Abia State; twenty (20) in Ebonyi state and nineteen (19) in Anambra State (Source: Offices of the State Civil Service Commission, South-East, January, 2014).

Hence, out of thirty-seven ministries existing on the overall, there are ten (10) ministries uniformly featuring in all five state secretariats in the South-East during the study and these were selected for the study. The ministries include: Ministry of Finance; Ministry of Health; Ministry of Lands; Survey and Urban Development; Ministry of Youths and Sports; Ministry of Commerce and Industry; Ministry of Transport; Ministry of Education; Ministry of Information; Ministry of Agriculture; Ministry of Local Government and Chieftaincy Matters . Each of the ministries in the five state secretariats were delivered ten copies of questionnaire; making it a hundred (100) copies of questionnaire to each state secretariat, and a total of five hundred (500) copies of questionnaire in all five state secretariats. The instrument used for the data collection was a pre-coded 35-item questionnaire. The items of the questionnaire addressed the variables related to the research questions for this study

5.1 Data Collection

Data collection took place in the months of January and February 2014, and covered a six-week period. Data were collected by administering a pre-coded 35 items questionnaire to elites aged (40-64) working at government secretariats located in capitals of the five constituent states understudy. Five research assistants were engaged for the purpose of distributing the questionnaire. A return rate of at least 96% was recorded.

5.2 Data Presentation and Analyses

The data analyzed in this study was obtained from 478 elites working at government secretariats located in capitals of the five constituent states of the sampled population under study. The overall results offer a wide range of premise.

Findings of the research demonstrate that 63% of respondents were male while 37% were female, thus indicating a considerable disparity in the distribution of both sexes. The demographic data also reveal that majority or 62% of respondents are within the age bracket of 40-45 years. This apparently represents the age group that dominates civil service work force in the South-Eastern State Secretariats. The tables below highlight the major findings of the study in relation to other variables of study.

Table 1
Respondents' Traditional and New Media Use and Access

Media	Which of these media do you use most?	Which mass medium gives you daily general information?	Which mass medium gives you professional related information?
Radio	56%	48%	14%
Television	32%	23%	33%
Newspaper	4%	27%	25%
Internet	8%	2%	28%
Total	100% (*n*=478)	100% (*n*=478)	100% (*n*=478)

Table 1 above shows the percentage distribution of respondents' use and access to traditional and new media. The study data shows that majority of respondents (56%) use the radio, followed by 32% who use television, while, four and eight percent agree to use newspaper and internet respectively. Further the table also displays data on

respondents needs for gratifications by the different media. In this instance radio appear as choice medium for the audience on general information (48%) while television takes the lead on professional related information.

The results from the table above show that respondents use and access the traditional media for general and professional information as against the new media, although on professional related information a little below one-third of respondents affirm the use of Internet.

Table 2
Respondents' Frequency of Use of New and Traditional Media Platforms

	How often do you use television?	How often do you use radio?	How often do you use newspaper?	How often do you use the internet?
Everyday regularly	45%	47%	8%	4%
5-6 days a week	9%	20%	13%	4%
3-4 days a week	24%	20%	48%	43%
1-2 days a week	21%	13%	31%	48%
Never	1%	0%	0%	1%
Total	100% (*n*=478)	100% (*n*=478)	100% (*n*=478)	100% (*n*=476)

Table 2 above shows the percentage distribution of respondents' frequency of use of new and traditional mass media platforms. The study data show that on a regular basis, 47% of respondents use radio; 45% use television; whereas 8% and 4% use newspapers and internet respectively.

The table also displays data on weekly consumption habit of respondents. Here, radio has the highest number of use within the week with 20% for 5-6days and 3-4 days a week consumption; while Internet, has a high consumption of 48% on 1-2 days consumption pattern and newspaper ranked highest with 48% on 3-4 days consumption mode. This result shows that a majority of respondents who use radio and television regularly spend little time on newspaper and Internet. Analyses also show that frequency of use of Internet and newspapers among respondents score lowest and fall within 1-2 days and 3-4 days a week; Internet being the least frequently used.

Table 3
Respondents' Best Way of Accessing Traditional Media

	How best do you access television?	How best do you access radio?	How best do you access newspaper?
Traditional - TV viewing/radio listening/ newspaper reading	99%	99%	85%
Online mobile device	1%	1%	14%
Computer	-	0%	1%
Total	100% (*n*=478)	100% (*n*=478)	100% (*n*=478)

Table 3 above presents the percentage distribution of respondents' prominent means of accessing traditional media. Data show that 99% of respondents prefer accessing television through traditional TV viewing as against online mobile device or computer. This is followed by another 99% of respondents who agree to access radio using traditional radio listening and 85% of respondents who access newspaper through traditional readership as against online mobile devices and computer access. As can be seen in the table, the data indicate a prevalence of access to traditional media platforms by respondents through traditional means instead of through online mobile devices or computer.

Table 4
Respondents' Media Use Pattern

	Which of the media is your preferred source of information?	Which of the media is your preferred source of entertainment?	Which of the media is your preferred medium for relaxation?	Which of the media is your preferred source of education?
Television	31%	65%	40%	4%
Radio	38%	33%	42%	28%
Newspaper	27%	-	17%	54%
Internet	4%	2%	1%	14%
Total	100% (*n*=478)	100% (*n*=478)	100% (*n*=478)	100% (*n*=478)

Table 4 above shows percentage distribution of respondents' choice of media and uses the pattern for needs of gratifications. The data above indicate that 38% of respondents prefer radio to other media as source of information; 65% prefer television as media of choice for entertainment, 42% prefer radio again as choice medium for relaxation, while 54% prefer Newspaper to other media as source of education. This shows a predominance of respondents' choice of traditional media, especially radio medium for gratification of media needs as against the new media of Internet.

From the array of data presented in Table 4, it is deduced that traditional media take the lead in offering respondents gratifications for information, entertainment, education, and relaxation needs. Though, television's preference drastically dropped in the aspect of respondents' choice of media for education, making television less attractive to respondents in the area of education. The greatest proportion of respondents, interestingly, obtains gratification from the newspaper in terms of education. Surprisingly, Internet, which has had low representation in other motivational indices, had boost in the area of education, making the Internet a considerable source of education among respondents.

The above results when juxtaposed with previous literatures on motivations, needs and gratifications for which younger people use the Internet (Chifwepa, 2003; Tadasad et al., 2003; Sevirosse & Mutula, 2004; Anunobi, 2006; Awoleye et al., 2008; Oyero, 2013), would suggest a corroboration that both elites civil servants who use the Internet and younger media users obtain gratifications of educational needs through the Internet.

Table 5
Respondents' Choice Between New and Traditional Media in Achieving More Active Goals

	Percent
Traditional media	70%
New media	30%
Total	100% (*n*=478)

Table 5 above presents percentage distribution of respondents' choice between new and traditional media in achieving more active goals. From the table 70% of respondents choose the traditional media for achieving more active goals, while 30% agree to the choice of new media for achieving more active goals. This generally shows that the level of adoption of traditional media among respondents is higher than that of new media, even in the existing new media environment.

Table 6
Activity Performed Most With the Internet by Respondents

Activities	Percent
Games	.2%
Financial transaction	.4%
Chatting	.2%
E-mail	31%
Obtain business information	.2%
For News	29%
Further education related information	18%
For Research	21%
For shopping	-
For buying tickets	-
Total	100% (*n*=474)

The data in Table 6 above show percentage distribution of activities performed most by respondents using the Internet. The data indicate that as low as 2%, 4% and 2% of respondents use the Internet for games, financial transaction and chatting respectively; 31% use the Internet for email transactions; 2% obtain business information using the Internet; 29% use the Internet for news; 18% receive further education related information through the Internet; while 21% do research using the Internet. This shows that there is the prevalent use of the Internet for emails, news, further education related information and research among respondents. These motivations for choice of Internet use by the elites are consistent with those of younger people as reflected in previous literatures (Chifwepa, 2003; Tadasad et al., 2003; Sevirosse & Mutula, 2004; Anunobi, 2006; Awoleye et al., 2008; Oyero, 2013).

DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

The findings of this study clearly suggest that the elites used in this study are exposed to and use both traditional and new media forms. However, overall result points to a high degree of use of traditional media as against new media. For instance, majority of respondents have a high preference for the traditional media to satisfy their information needs. Similarly, respondents who reported heavy usage/exposure to television and radio show decline in use of the Internet. Although convergence is apparent in the Nigerian media environment yet, majority of the respondents predominantly access traditional media platforms through traditional means instead of through online mobile devices or computer, which are new media channels.

Interestingly, the study reveals that most elites use the Internet for email and education related services

more than for any other need gratification. On general media use pattern we found a repetitive preference or consumption pattern for traditional media than the new media. When we situate this within the displacement and complementary argument, we found that media consumption pattern of elites in Nigeria, tilts towards the supplementary debate, where elites seem inclined to use the new media to supplement what they have from the traditional media while the traditional media still dominate in the media consumption pattern of elites in Nigeria.

This complementary media use phenomenon is reinforced in Hargrove and Bernt's study conducted in Stempel (as cited in Nguyen & Western, 2006) where they compared survey data between 1995 and 1999 to discover that although there was a considerable decline in regular traditional media usage, Internet had no adverse effect on the use of traditional news products, but also that Internet users were more likely than non-users in all age, income, education, and sex groups to read newspapers and listen to radio news. They concluded that Internet and traditional media uses are supplementary or complementary.

Although the Internet could potentially emulate all media, this research suggests that respondents do not employ the Internet for exactly the same purposes as the traditional media and suggest that audiences choose particular medium to gratify particular media need. For example, the data indicate that users predominantly use radio as sources of information; television for entertainment; radio and television for relaxation and newspaper and Internet as sources of education. These results contradict findings of previous literatures which analyzed media use pattern of older adults between the ages of (30-40) and (50-64) in Alabama with empirical findings showing preference of social networking and Internet as their main source of national and international news (Gaddy, 2010; Pew Research Center for the People & the Press, 2010). This partially explains the premise that displacement effect does not exist among the research respondents especially with regard to information gathering and cognitive media needs. One may argue that a complementary use/combination of traditional and new media platforms may enhance the gratification of respondents' communication needs.

CONCLUSION

This study focused on a comparative analysis of traditional and new media use among elites segment of the audience who is civil servants in state government ministries in the South-East Nigeria. This is against the backdrop that in Nigeria, the purpose for which audience groups such as the civil servants, politicians, academicians, business controllers, etc, use the new media are still unknown, whereas previous literatures suggest that a good percentage of youths use social media and online platforms to engage mostly in social activities

and entertainment (Adomi et al., 2003; Nwesige, 2004; Omotayo, 2006; Alao & Folorunsho, 2008; Obijiofor, 2009; Agboola, 2014) thereby leaving an analytical gap in terms of new media discourse in Nigeria.

The study used survey method and in determining the media use behaviors and motives of elites, the Uses and Gratification Theory was used to anchor the study and was validated in the study. This study corroborates what the uses and gratifications theory of the media entail. For instance, the choice and use of radio was linked to gratification of information and relaxation needs of the respondents; the choice and use of television was linked to the gratification of entertainment and relaxation needs of the audience; while further education related information, research, email transactions and news needs were motivations for use of the Internet by the respondents. These findings, therefore, further validate the rationale for application of the uses and gratification theory in this study.

Data gathered show an inclination by majority of elites used in this study to be exposed to traditional media more regularly than the new media of the Internet. Respondents who reported above average usage and heavy usage to television and radio show considerable decline in the use of Internet. From the data, we understand that there is not much sign yet of a paradigm shift in media consumption pattern of the elites in Nigeria despite the introduction, access and use of the new media by this group. Rather what we have as suggested by the data is a case where the new media is seen as an extension of the traditional media. Another surprising finding is that, the popularity of newspapers as source of daily information is in decline among elites.

Contrary to pervasive evidence from previous studies, the findings from this study do not support the more-more relationship between general internet usage and traditional news use or even the displacement effect. Rather, the survey is indicative of a reinforcement perspective where the new media is used to reinforce information and needs gratification and not as primary source of information. As suggested by academic scholars in relation to the developing culture, what seems tenable because of slow adoption of technology and other intervening variables is the complementary effect, while in the future a gradual displacement process may emerge. For now the Internet is a functional alternative to traditional media in Nigeria. However, we need to point out that this finding does not discredit the displacement effect argument, but is in consonance with what we have learnt from historical development of media technology. We can adequately sum up with Nguyen & Western's (2006) apt words thus: …the historical coexistence of old and new media will continue in the Internet age. At least within the provision of news and information, instead of driving out the old media, the Internet will complement them in serving the seemingly insatiable news and information needs among a

substantial segment of society. Decline of traditional news and information usage might be under way, especially when the Internet becomes the most relied-on news and information source – but it is unlikely for any replacement (absolute displacement) to occur.

REFERENCES

Althaus, S. L., & Tewksbury, D. (2000). Patterns of internet and traditional news media use in a networked community. *Political Communication*, 17 (1), 21-45.

Bennett, J., & Strange, N. (2008). The BBC's second-shift aesthetics: Interactive television, multi-platform projects and public service content for a digital era. *Media International Australia*, *126,* 145-154.

Bolter, J. D. (2003). Theory and practice in new media studies. In G. Liestol, A. Morrison & T. Rasmussen (Eds.), *Digital media revisted: Theoretical and conceptual innovations in digital domains* (pp.15-33). Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Cauwenberge, A. V., d'Haenens, L., & Beentjes, H. (2010). Emerging consumption patterns among young people of traditional and internet news platforms in the LowContries. *Observatorio (OBS) Journal, 4*(3), 335-352.

Chamberlain, M. A. (1994). New technologies in health communication. *American Behavioural Scientist, 38,* 271-284.

Chan, K., & Fang, W. (2007). Use of internet & traditional media among young people. *Young Consumers, 8*(4), 244-256.

Chesebro, J. W., & Holmes. (2009). Transformations created by digital communication technologies. In J. W. Chesebro (Eds.), *From 20th century beginnings to 21st century advances: Developing and evolving from a century of transformation*, studies in honour of the 100th anniversary of the eastern communication association. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Davis, R. & Owen, D. (1998). *New media and american politics.* Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press.

December, J. (1996). Units of analysis for internet communication. *Journal of Communication, 46*(1), 14-37.

Deifell, T. (2009). The big thaw: Charting a new future for journalism. *The Media Consortium, 2*(1), 2-14.

Diddi, A., & LaRose, R. (2006). Getting hooked on news: Uses and gratifications and the formation of news habits among college students in an internet environment. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media*, *50*(2), 193-210.

Dimmick, J., Chen, Y., & Li, Z. (2004). Competition between the internet and traditional news media: The gratification-opportunities niche dimension. *The Journal of Media Economics*, (1), 19-33.

Dutta-Bergman, M. J. (2004). Complementarity in consumption of news types across traditional and new media. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media, 23*(4), 425-447.

Elliot, P. (1974). Uses and gratifications research: A critique and a sociological alternative. In J. G. Blumler & E. Katz (Eds*.), The uses of mass communications: Current perspectives on gratifications research*, (pp.240-268). Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Elliot, S. (2008, April 2). NBC to revive a mainstay of early TV. *The New York Times*, p.7.

Gaddy, H. D. (2010). *Age differences for alternate media use: How different age groups use and want their news* (pp.1-8). Knight Fellow in Community Journalism, University of Alabama.

Harun, Z., Abu Bakar, M. Z., Gapor, S. A., & Mohd Nor, W. A. N. (2011). Patterns of internet and traditional media use for political participation in Malaysia. *International Journal of Cyber Society and Education, 4*(1), 31.

Katz, E. (1987). Communication research since lazarsfeld. *Public Opinion Quarterly, 51,* 525-545.

Katz, E., Blumler, J., & Gurevitch, M. (1974). Utilization of mass communication by the individual. In J. Blumler & E. Katz (Eds.), *The uses of mass communication: Current perspectives on gratifications research* (pp.19-34). Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Kayany, J., & Yelsma, P. (2000). Displacement effect of online media in the socio-technical contexts of households. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media, 44*(2), 215-229.

Kim, J., & Rubin, A. M. (1997). The variable influence of audience activity on media effects. *Communication Research, 24,* 107-135.

Kuehn, S. A. (1994). Computer-mediated communication in instructional settings: A research agenda. *Communication Education*, 4, 3-17.

Landow, G. (1991). *Hypertext: The convergence of contemporary critical theory and technology*. Baltimore, MD: John Hopkins University Press.

LaRose, R., & Eastin, M. S. (2004). A social cognitive theory of internet uses and gratifications: Toward a new model of media attendance. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media, 48*(3), 358-377.

Lee, A. M., & Delli Carpini, M. X. (2010). *News consumption revisited: Examining the power of habits in the 21st century.* A Paper Presented at the 11th International Symposium on Online Journalism.

Lee, P., & Leung, L. (2004). *Assessing the displacement effects of the internet.* Paper presented at the International Conference on Internet Communication in Intelligent Societies, School of Journalism & Communication, Chinese University of Hong Kong, July 8-10.

Lin, C., Salwen, M. B., Garrison, B., & Driscoll, P. D. (2005). Online News as a Functional Substitute for Offline News. In M. B. Salwen, B. Garrison, & P. D. Driscoll (Eds.), *Online news and the public* (pp.237-255). New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Lister, M., Dovey, J., Griddings, S., Grant, I., & Kelly, K. (2003). *New media: A critical introduction*. London: Routledge.

Manovich, L. (2001). *The language of new media* (pp.9-100). Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

McCombs, M. E., & Nolan, J. (1992). The relative constancy approach to consumer spending for media. *Journal of Media Economics, 5*(2), 43-52.

McLuhan, M. (1962). The galaxy reconfigured or the plight of mass man in an individualist society. In N. Wardrip-Fruin & N. Monfort (Eds.), *The new media reader* (pp.194-202). Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

MediaReachOMD. (2010). *Media facts AMPS report*.

Miall, D. S. (1999). Trivializing or liberating? The limitations of hypertext theorizing. *Mosaic, 32,* 157-171.

Morris, M., & Ogan, C. (1996). The internet as mass media. *Journal of Communication*, *46*(1), 39-50.

Nguyen, A., Ferrier, E., Western, M., & Mckay, S. (2005). Online news in Australia: Patterns of use and gratification. *Australian Studies in Journalism, 15,* 3-34.

Nguyen, A., & Western, M. (2006). The complementary relationship between the internet and traditional mass media: The case of online news and information. *Information Research, 11*(3), 1-18.

O'Neill, B. (2005). *Does the internet fundamentally change anything? European research and the COST A20 action on the impact of the internet on mass media (television, newspapers and radio)*. School of Media Conference Papers. Dublin Institute of Technology.

Pew Research Center for the People and the Press. (2006, July 30). *Maturing internet news audience—Broader than deep: Online papers modestly boost newspaper readership*.

Pew Research Center, Biennial News Consumption Survey. (2008). *Audience segments in a changing news environment: Key news audiences now blend online and traditional sources*. Retrieved from http://people-press.org/reports/pdf/444.pdf

Roy, S. K. (2008). Determining uses and gratifications for indian internet users. *CS-BIGS*, *2*(2), 78-91.

Salman, A., Ibrahim, F., H. J., Abdullah, M. Y., Mustaffa, N., & Mahbob, M. H. (2011). The impact of new media on traditional mainstream mass media. *The Innovation Journal: The Public Sector Innovation Journal, 16*(3), 1-11. Retrieved 2014, May 4 from http://www.innovation.cc/scholarly-style/aliSamman_new+media_impac116v3i7a.pdf

Scolari, C. A. (2009). Mapping conversations about new media: The theoretical field of digital communication, New Media and Society. *London: Sage Publications, 11*(6), 943-964.

Severin, W. J., & Tankard, W. J. (1997). *Communication theories origins, methods, and uses in the mass media* (4th ed.). White Plains, NY: Longman.

Sparks, C. (2003). The contribution of online newspapers to the public sphere: A UK case study. *Trends in Communication*, *1*(2).

Stempel, G., Hargrove, T., & Bernt, J. (2000). Relation of growth of use of the internet to changes in media use from 1995 to 1999. *Journal of Mass Communication Quarterly, 77*(1), 71-79.

Were, J. (2010). *New media's power emerges in Uganda, but mainly among affluent urbanites*. Field Blog. Retrieved 2013, April 19 from http:/www.audiencescapes.org/new-media%E2%80%99s-power-emerges-uganda-mainly-among-affluent-urbanites-412

Williams, A. (2006, July 16). The graying of the record store. *The New York Times*.

Williams, F., Rice, R. E., & Rogers, E. M. (1988). *Research methods and the new media*. New York, NY: Free Press.

Williams, F., Philips, A. F., & Palmgreen, L. P. (Eds.). (n.d.). *Media gratifications research: Current perspectives*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage Publications.

Wimmer, R. D., & Dominick, J. R. (1994). *Mass media research: An introduction*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.

Yap, B. (2009). Time running out for newspaper. *The Malaysian Insider*. Retrieved 2010, October 31 from www.themalaysianinsider.com/index.php/opinion/brian-yap/28538-time-running-out-for-newspapers